



VICTORIAN REPORTS

THE AUTHORISED LAW REPORTS OF THE
SUPREME COURT OF VICTORIA

VOLUME 71
2021–2023

EDITOR
P G WILLIS SC

Published for the
COUNCIL OF LAW REPORTING IN VICTORIA
BY
LITTLE WILLIAM BOURKE
AUSTRALIA
2024





Little William Bourke (ABN 65 610 951 089).
AUSTRALIA Level 22
52 Martin Place
Sydney NSW 2000
Australia

ELECTRONIC victorianreports.com.au
littlewilliambourke.com.au

EMAIL sales@victorianreports.com.au

National Library of Australia Cataloguing-in-Publication entry

ISBN-13: 978-1-925633-24-5

ISSN: 0042-5214 (print); 2208-4886 (online).

©2024 Council of Law Reporting in Victoria

This book is copyright except as permitted under the *Copyright Act 1968* (Cth), no part of this publication may be reproduced by any process electronic or otherwise, without the specific written permission of the copyright owner. Neither may information be stored electronically in any form whatsoever without such permission.

Inquiries should be addressed to Little William Bourke.

Printed in Australia.

COUNCIL OF LAW REPORTING IN VICTORIA

As at 31 December 2023

Chair

THE HON JAMES PETER GORTON

Ex-Officio Members

THE ATTORNEY-GENERAL

THE SOLICITOR-GENERAL

THE LIBRARIAN OF THE SUPREME COURT OF VICTORIA
(LAURELLE MARGARET ATKINSON)

Members

MICHAEL RICHARD PEARCE SC

DAVID HUGH COLMAN

ANDREW ROBERT WESTCOTT

STEVEN SAPOUNTSIS

Honorary Secretary

GEOFFREY CHARLES HANSEN

Editor

P G WILLIS SC

Consultant Editor

L W MAHER

Law Reporters

N J BIRD

N BLOK

R J BOADLE

C J CHARNLEY

A J CLAYTON-GREENE

E S DOBER

H M DOUGLAS

T B D GORTON

A L HANDS

C A HOOPER

E LEVINE

K LYLE

W G PHILLIPS

A TERZIC

K WESTON-SCHEUBER

P G WILLIS SC

BARRISTERS-AT-LAW

D L PORTER

SOLICITOR

THE SUPREME COURT OF VICTORIA

As at 31 December 2023

CHIEF JUSTICE

THE HON ANNE FERGUSON

PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF APPEAL

THE HON KARIN LEIGH EMERTON

JUDGES OF APPEAL

THE HON PHILLIP GEOFFREY PRIEST
THE HON DAVID FRANCIS RASHLEIGH BEACH
THE HON STEPHEN GEOFFREY EDWIN MCLEISH
THE HON RICHARD MICHAEL NIALL
THE HON MAREE EVELYN KENNEDY
THE HON KRISTEN LOUISE WALKER
THE HON CAMERON CLYDE MACAULAY
THE HON LESLEY ANN TAYLOR
THE HON KEVIN JOSEPH ALOYSIUS LYONS
THE HON CHRISTOPHER BEAUMONT BOYCE

JUDGES OF THE TRIAL DIVISION

THE HON ELIZABETH JANE HOLLINGWORTH
THE HON ANTHONY LEWIS CAVANOUGH
THE HON JAMES DUDLEY ELLIOTT
THE HON MELANIE SLOSS
THE HON MICHAEL JAMES CROUCHER
THE HON CHRISTOPHER WILLIAM BEALE
THE HON MICHAEL PHILLIP McDONALD
THE HON RITA MARIA INCERTI
THE HON JANE ALISON DIXON
THE HON ANDREW JOHN KEOGH
THE HON PETER BARRINGTON KIDD
THE HON MICHELLE LESLEY QUIGLEY
THE HON MATTHEW NEIL CONNOCK
THE HON MELINDA JANE RICHARDS
THE HON STEVEN JAMES MOORE
THE HON ANDREW JAMES TINNEY
THE HON JACINTA MARY FORBES
THE HON LISA MICHELLE NICHOLS
THE HON CHRISTOPHER JAMES DELANY
THE HON KATHRYN LUCY STYNES
THE HON JAMES PETER GORTON
THE HON MICHAEL SUMNER OSBORNE
THE HON STEPHEN ANDREW O'MEARA
THE HON RICHARD HUGO MUECKE ATTIWILL

THE HON AMANDA CLAIRE FOX
THE HON ANDREA JOSEPHINE TSALAMANDRIS
THE HON LISA ANNE HANNAN
THE HON EDWARD WINSLOW WOODWARD
THE HON PETER ROSS DARLING GRAY
THE HON PATRICIA ANNE MATHEWS
THE HON IAN GRAHAM WALLER
THE HON CLAIRE MICHELLE HARRIS
THE HON ANDREW JOHN WATSON
THE HON PAUL JAMES COSGRAVE

RESERVE JUDGES

THE HON ROBERT STANLEY OSBORN
THE HON LEX LASRY AM
THE HON GREGORY HOWARD GARDE AO
THE HON SIMON PAUL WHELAN
THE HON KIM WILLIAM SPENCER HARGRAVE
THE HON JOHN HERBERT LYTTON FORREST
THE HON CLYDE ELLIOTT CROFT AM
THE HON STEPHEN WILLIAM KAYE AM
THE HON JOHN ROSS CHAMPION
THE HON KATE MCMILLAN
THE HON PETER JULIAN RIORDAN
THE HON TERENCE MICHAEL FORREST
THE HON ELIZABETH LILLIAN FULLERTON
THE HON JOHN RUSSELL DIXON
THE HON TIMOTHY JAMES GINNANE
THE HON MICHAEL KINGSLEY MEEK

ASSOCIATE JUDGES

THE HON MELISSA LEE DALY
THE HON SIMON PETER GARDINER
THE HON MARY-JANE IERODIACONOU
THE HON JULIAN MICHEL KALMAN HETYEY
THE HON IAN ANDREW IRVING
THE HON FIONA JUNE STEFFENSEN
THE HON MATTHEW PIERRE BARRETT
THE HON CATHERINE FLAVIA GOBBO
THE HON CAROLINE ANNE GOULDEN

RESERVE ASSOCIATE JUDGES

THE HON DAVID MARK BRUDENELL DERHAM
THE HON ALEXANDER JAMIE WOOD
THE HON JOHN EFTHIM

JUDICIAL REGISTRARS

LEONIE MARGARET ENGLEFIELD

MARK WILLIAM PEDLEY

MARTIN KEITH

TIMOTHY RICHARD FREEMAN

ANDREW BAKER

KIM WORONCZAK

DANIEL DONATO CAPORALE

DOMENICO CONDIDI

DEIRDRE MCCANN

ELIZABETH TUENO

CLAIRE GITSHAM

JUDGE IN ADMIRALTY

THE HON MATTHEW NEIL CONNOCK

ATTORNEY-GENERAL

THE HON JACLYN SYMES MP

SOLICITOR-GENERAL

ROWENA ORR KC

Memoranda

2023

- 31 October The Hon Kevin Joseph Aloysius Lyons, a Judge of the Trial Division since 2018, was appointed a Justice of Appeal.
- 1 November The Hon Nemeer Mukhtar, an Associate Justice since 2009, retired.
- 2 November Caroline Anne Goulden was appointed an Associate Judge.
- 4 November The Hon Timothy James Ginnane, a Judge of the Trial Division since 2013, retired.
- Claire Michelle Harris KC was appointed a Judge of the Trial Division.
- 13 November Andrew John Watson was appointed a Judge of the Trial Division.
- 21 November Christopher Beaumont Boyce KC was appointed a Judge and Justice of Appeal.
- 8 December His Honour Judge Paul James Cosgrave KC was appointed a Judge of the Trial Division.
- 22 December The Hon Michael Leon Sifris, a Judge since 2010 and Justice of Appeal since 2020, retired.

Corrigendum

69 VR 451: at p 452, line 2. For 'Couty', substitute 'County'.