

# VICTORIAN REPORTS

THE AUTHORISED LAW REPORTS OF THE  
**SUPREME COURT OF VICTORIA**

**VOLUME 59**  
2017-2019

EDITOR  
**P G WILLIS SC**

Published for the  
**COUNCIL OF LAW REPORTING IN VICTORIA**  
BY  
**LITTLE WILLIAM BOURKE**  
AUSTRALIA  
2020



Little William Bourke

**Little William Bourke** (ABN 65 610 951 089).  
AUSTRALIA Level 22  
52 Martin Place  
Sydney NSW 2000  
Australia  
  
ELECTRONIC [victorianreports.com.au](http://victorianreports.com.au)  
[littlewilliambourke.com.au](http://littlewilliambourke.com.au)

National Library of Australia Cataloguing-in-Publication entry

---

ISBN-13: 978-1-925633-12-2

ISSN: 0042-5214 (print); 2208-4886 (online).

---

©2020 Council of Law Reporting in Victoria

This book is copyright except as permitted under the *Copyright Act 1968* (Cth), no part of this publication may be reproduced by any process electronic or otherwise, without the specific written permission of the copyright owner. Neither may information be stored electronically in any form whatsoever without such permission.

Inquiries should be addressed to Little William Bourke.

Printed in Australia.

# COUNCIL OF LAW REPORTING IN VICTORIA

As at 31 March 2020

## **Chairman**

THE HON JUSTICE CAMERON CLYDE MACAULAY

## **Ex-Officio members**

THE ATTORNEY-GENERAL

THE SOLICITOR-GENERAL

THE LIBRARIAN OF THE SUPREME COURT OF VICTORIA  
(LAURELLE MARGARET ATKINSON)

## **Members**

MICHAEL RICHARD PEARCE SC

ANNETTE MINA CHARAK

ANDREW ROBERT WESTCOTT

STEVEN SAPOUNTSIS

## **Honorary Secretary**

GEOFFREY CHARLES HANSEN

---

## **Editor**

P G WILLIS SC

## **Consultant Editor**

L W MAHER

## **Law Reporters**

N BLOK

R J BOADLE

C J CHARNLEY

T FARHALL

T B D GORTON

A T HOEL

L C HOGAN

D I MENCE

M G NARAYAN

J P O'CONNOR

R K SORENSEN

M D TEHAN

S J VARNEY

P G WILLIS SC

## **BARRISTERS-AT-LAW**

D L PORTER

J R WANG

## **SOLICITORS**

E J MAKEIG

## **TIPSTAFF**

**THE SUPREME COURT OF VICTORIA**

As at 31 March 2020

**CHIEF JUSTICE**

THE HON ANNE FERGUSON

**PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF APPEAL**

THE HON CHRISTOPHER MURRAY MAXWELL AC

**JUDGES OF APPEAL**

THE HON PAMELA MARY TATE

THE HON SIMON PAUL WHELAN

THE HON PHILLIP GEOFFREY PRIEST

THE HON DAVID FRANCIS RASHLEIGH BEACH

THE HON EMILIOS JOHN KYROU

THE HON STEPHEN WILLIAM KAYE AM

THE HON STEPHEN GEOFFREY EDWIN MCLEISH

THE HON RICHARD MICHAEL NIAL

THE HON KIM WILLIAM SPENCER HARGRAVE

THE HON TERENCE MICHAEL FORREST

THE HON KARIN LEIGH EMERTON

**JUDGES OF THE TRIAL DIVISION**

THE HON ELIZABETH JANE HOLLINGWORTH

THE HON ANTHONY LEWIS CAVANOUGH

THE HON MICHAEL LEON SIFRIS

THE HON PETER WADDINGTON ALMOND

THE HON JOHN RUSSELL DIXON

THE HON CAMERON CLYDE MACAULAY

THE HON KATE MCMILLAN

THE HON GEOFFREY JOHN DIGBY

THE HON JAMES DUDLEY ELLIOTT

THE HON TIMOTHY JAMES GINNANE

THE HON MELANIE SLOSS

THE HON MICHAEL JAMES CROUCHER

THE HON JOANNE MARGARET CAMERON

THE HON CHRISTOPHER WILLIAM BEALE

THE HON MICHAEL PHILLIP McDONALD

THE HON RITA MARIA INCERTI (FORMERLY ZAMMIT)

THE HON PETER JULIAN RIORDAN

THE HON JANE ALISON DIXON

THE HON ANDREW JOHN KEOGH

THE HON PETER BARRINGTON KIDD

THE HON MAREE EVELYN KENNEDY

THE HON MICHELLE LESLEY QUIGLEY

THE HON JOHN ROSS CHAMPION

THE HON MATTHEW NEIL CONNOCK

THE HON MELINDA JANE RICHARDS  
THE HON KEVIN JOSEPH ALOYSIUS LYONS  
THE HON LESLEY ANN TAYLOR  
THE HON STEVEN JAMES MOORE  
THE HON ANDREW JAMES TINNEY  
THE HON JACINTA MARY FORBES  
THE HON LISA MICHELLE NICHOLS

**RESERVE JUDGES**

THE HON PAUL ANTHONY COGHLAN AO  
THE HON MALCOLM FRASER BLUE  
THE HON ROSS MCKENZIE ROBSON  
THE HON MARK SAMUEL WEINBERG AO  
THE HON ROBERT STANLEY OSBORN  
THE HON LEX LASRY AM  
THE HON GREGORY HOWARD GARDE AO

**ASSOCIATE JUDGES**

THE HON JOHN EFTHIM  
THE HON ALEXANDER JAMIE WOOD  
THE HON ROBYN GAY LANSDOWNE  
THE HON MELISSA LEE DALY  
THE HON SIMON PETER GARDINER  
THE HON NEMEER MUKHTAR  
THE HON RODNEY STUART RANDALL  
THE HON MARY-JANE IERODIACONOU  
THE HON JULIAN MICHEL KALMAN HETYEY

**RESERVE ASSOCIATE JUDGE**

THE HON DAVID MARK BRUDENELL DERHAM

**JUDICIAL REGISTRARS**

MARGARET CAIRNS GOURLAY

IAN ANDREW IRVING

LEONIE MARGARET ENGLEFIELD

PATRICIA MATTHEWS

MARK WILLIAM PEDLEY

JULIE KIRSTEN CLAYTON

MARTIN KEITH

**JUDGE IN ADMIRALTY**

THE HON GEOFFREY JOHN DIGBY

**ATTORNEY-GENERAL**

THE HON JILL HENNESSY MP

**SOLICITOR-GENERAL**

KRISTEN WALKER QC

## Memoranda

### 2020

- |             |                                                                                                   |
|-------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 10 January  | The Honourable David Mark Brudenell Derham, an Associate Judge since 2012, retired.               |
| 5 February  | Martin Keith was appointed a Judicial Registrar.                                                  |
| 11 February | Julian Michel Kalman Hetyey, a Judicial Registrar since 2014, was appointed an Associate Justice. |
| 28 February | Daniel Donato Caporale, a Judicial Registrar since 2018, resigned.                                |
| 12 March    | The Honourable Kevin Harcourt Bell AM, a Judge of the Trial Division since 2005, retired.         |

---

### Corrigendum

In vol 58, p 593, the second sentence in the first holding in the headnote should read 'It was open to the judge to accept the juror's statement that he had no knowledge of either the applicant or the applicant's mother'.