

VICTORIAN REPORTS

THE AUTHORISED LAW REPORTS OF THE
SUPREME COURT OF VICTORIA

VOLUME 64
2020-2021

EDITOR
P G WILLIS SC

Published for the
COUNCIL OF LAW REPORTING IN VICTORIA
BY
LITTLE WILLIAM BOURKE
AUSTRALIA
2022



Little William Bourke (ABN 65 610 951 089).
AUSTRALIA Level 22
52 Martin Place
Sydney NSW 2000
Australia

ELECTRONIC victorianreports.com.au
littlewilliambourke.com.au

EMAIL sales@victorianreports.com.au

National Library of Australia Cataloguing-in-Publication entry

ISBN-13: 978-1-925633-17-7

ISSN: 0042-5214 (print); 2208-4886 (online).

©2022 Council of Law Reporting in Victoria

This book is copyright except as permitted under the *Copyright Act 1968* (Cth), no part of this publication may be reproduced by any process electronic or otherwise, without the specific written permission of the copyright owner. Neither may information be stored electronically in any form whatsoever without such permission.

Inquiries should be addressed to Little William Bourke.

Printed in Australia.

COUNCIL OF LAW REPORTING IN VICTORIA

As at 31 December 2021

Chairman

THE HON JUSTICE CAMERON CLYDE MACAULAY

Ex-Officio members

THE ATTORNEY-GENERAL

THE SOLICITOR-GENERAL

THE LIBRARIAN OF THE SUPREME COURT OF VICTORIA
(LAURELLE MARGARET ATKINSON)

Members

MICHAEL RICHARD PEARCE SC

ANNETTE MINA CHARAK

ANDREW ROBERT WESTCOTT

STEVEN SAPOUNTSIS

Honorary Secretary

GEOFFREY CHARLES HANSEN

Editor

P G WILLIS SC

Consultant Editor

L W MAHER

Law Reporters

N J BAUM

M BENNETT

N J BIRD

N J BLOK

R J BOADLE

C J CHARNLEY

T J CLARKE

A L HANDS

C A HOOPER

J P KRETZENBACHER

E LEVINE

C LUM

D I MENCE

J P STOLLER

A TERZIC

J R WANG

BARRISTERS-AT-LAW

THE SUPREME COURT OF VICTORIA

As at 31 December 2021

CHIEF JUSTICE

THE HON ANNE FERGUSON

PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF APPEAL

THE HON CHRISTOPHER MURRAY MAXWELL AC

JUDGES OF APPEAL

THE HON PHILLIP GEOFFREY PRIEST

THE HON DAVID FRANCIS RASHLEIGH BEACH

THE HON EMILIOS JOHN KYROU

THE HON STEPHEN GEOFFREY EDWIN MCLEISH

THE HON RICHARD MICHAEL NIALL

THE HON TERENCE MICHAEL FORREST

THE HON KARIN LEIGH EMERTON

THE HON MICHAEL LEON SIFRIS

THE HON MAREE EVELYN KENNEDY

THE HON KRISTEN LOUISE WALKER

JUDGES OF THE TRIAL DIVISION

THE HON ELIZABETH JANE HOLLINGWORTH

THE HON ANTHONY LEWIS CAVANOUGH

THE HON JOHN RUSSELL DIXON

THE HON CAMERON CLYDE MACAULAY

THE HON KATE MCMILLAN

THE HON JAMES DUDLEY ELLIOTT

THE HON TIMOTHY JAMES GINNANE

THE HON MELANIE SLOSS

THE HON MICHAEL JAMES CROUCHER

THE HON CHRISTOPHER WILLIAM BEALE

THE HON MICHAEL PHILLIP McDONALD

THE HON RITA MARIA INCERTI

THE HON PETER JULIAN RIORDAN

THE HON JANE ALISON DIXON

THE HON ANDREW JOHN KEOGH

THE HON PETER BARRINGTON KIDD

THE HON MICHELLE LESLEY QUIGLEY

THE HON MATTHEW NEIL CONNOCK

THE HON MELINDA JANE RICHARDS

THE HON KEVIN JOSEPH ALOYSIUS LYONS

THE HON LESLEY ANN TAYLOR

THE HON STEVEN JAMES MOORE

THE HON ANDREW JAMES TINNEY

THE HON JACINTA MARY FORBES

THE HON LISA MICHELLE NICHOLS
THE HON CHRISTOPHER JAMES DELANY
THE HON KATHRYN LUCY STYNES
THE HON JAMES PETER GORTON
THE HON MICHAEL SUMNER OSBORNE
THE HON STEPHEN ANDREW O'MEARA
THE HON RICHARD HUGO MUECKE ATTIWILL
THE HON CATHERINE GAIL BUTTON
THE HON AMANDA CLAIRE FOX

RESERVE JUDGES

THE HON PAUL ANTHONY COGHLAN AO
THE HON MALCOLM FRASER BLUE
THE HON ROSS MCKENZIE ROBSON
THE HON ROBERT STANLEY OSBORN
THE HON LEX LASRY AM
THE HON GREGORY HOWARD GARDE AO
THE HON SIMON PAUL WHELAN
THE HON CLYDE ELLIOTT CROFT AM
THE HON JOHN HERBERT LYTTON FORREST
THE HON STEPHEN WILLIAM KAYE AM

ASSOCIATE JUDGES

THE HON JOHN EFTHIM
THE HON MELISSA LEE DALY
THE HON SIMON PETER GARDINER
THE HON NEMEER MUKHTAR
THE HON RODNEY STUART RANDALL
THE HON MARY-JANE IERODIACONOU
THE HON JULIAN MICHEL KALMAN HETYEY
THE HON PATRICIA MATTHEWS
THE HON IAN ANDREW IRVING

RESERVE ASSOCIATE JUDGES

THE HON DAVID MARK BRUDENELL DERHAM
THE HON ALEXANDER JAMIE WOOD

JUDICIAL REGISTRARS

LEONIE MARGARET ENGLEFIELD

MARK WILLIAM PEDLEY

MARTIN KEITH

TIMOTHY RICHARD FREEMAN

FIONA JUNE STEFFENSEN

ANDREW BAKER

KIM WORONCZAK

DANIEL DONATO CAPORALE

DOMENICO CONDIDI

DEIRDRE McCANN

ELIZABETH TUENO

JUDGE IN ADMIRALTY

THE HON MATTHEW NEIL CONNOCK

ATTORNEY-GENERAL

THE HON JACLYN SYMES MP

SOLICITOR-GENERAL

ROWENA ORR QC

Memoranda

2021

- 24 January Julie Clayton, a Judicial Registrar since 2017, resigned.
- 9 July Meg Gourlay, a Judicial Registrar since 2011, retired.
- 18 July The Honourable Geoffrey John Digby, a Judge of the Court since 2012, retired.
- 27 July Ian Andrew Irving, a Judicial Registrar since 2016, was appointed an Associate Judge.
- Daniel Donato Caporale, a Judicial Registrar from 2018 to 2020, was re-appointed a Judicial Registrar.
- Domenico Condidì was appointed a Judicial Registrar.
- 9 August Catherine Gail Button QC was appointed a Judge of the Trial Division.
- 13 August The Honourable John Ross Champion, a Judge of the Court since 2017, retired.
- Her Honour Judge Amanda Claire Fox was appointed a Judge of the Trial Division.
- 28 September Deirdre McCann was appointed a Judicial Registrar.
- Elizabeth Tueno was appointed a Judicial Registrar.
- 13 December The Honourable Stephen William Kaye AM, a judge of the Court since 2003 and Judge of Appeal since 2015, retired.